



Meeting Minutes

Citizen Rate Review Committee

Tuesday, August 4, 2020

5:00 PM

Virtual Zoom Meeting

This meeting will be held virtually via Zoom.

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman McErlean called the meeting to order at 5:01 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Present: 13 - Committee Member Deshuk, Committee Member Booth, Committee Member Fallon, Committee Member Smith, Committee Member Nepomuceno, Committee Member Majeska, Committee Member Lombardo, Committee Member Lowell, Committee Member McErlean, Committee Member Minarik, Committee Member Perez, Alternate Gioia and Alternate Paine

Staff Present: Public Works Director Javier Setovich, Public Works Deputy Director Christine Smith, Solid Waste Superintendent Adam Kurtz

Committee Member Minarik arrived at 5:27 p.m.; however, he had informed the Chairman in advance that he would be running a little late.

APPROVE MINUTES

1. [MINUTES](#) Approve draft minutes of the Citizen Rate Review Committee meeting held on July
[2020-156](#) 28, 2020.

MOTION BY Committee Member Lowell, SECONDED BY Committee Member Fallon, that the Minutes be APPROVED. The motion carried by the following vote:

Ayes: 10 - Committee Member Deshuk, Committee Member Booth, Committee Member Fallon, Committee Member Smith, Committee Member Nepomuceno, Committee Member Majeska, Committee Member Lombardo, Committee Member Lowell, Committee Member McErlean, Committee Member Perez, Alternate Gioia and Alternate Paine

Absent: 1 - Committee Member Minarik

CITIZENS COMMENTS/ APPEARANCES FROM THE FLOOR

None.

BUSINESS

2. Staff Presentations

Public Works Director Setovich welcomed the participants and said that the committee is getting to a milestone with information and, at the next meeting storm water will be discussed. He acknowledged that staff has been receiving questions about rates and costs during the meetings but that information, thus far, has strategically been left out to ensure the committee better understands the processes first and the “why” of what’s being done before looking at rates or costs. Following Setovich’s welcome, committee members had the following questions and responses provided are also below preceded by an “A”:

1. I assume utilities are enterprise funds. Can you, at some point, provide an overview of what enterprise funds mean to the City for those that might not know? A: Yes, we will create that baseline of knowledge.
2. Can you please talk about the figure on the CIP schedule for Brine Disposal in 2023? A: We will get into more detail later, especially those with that level of impact. I don’t have the information at the top of my head.
3. It says it’s \$46.3 million. A: Yes, it’s an expensive enterprise and an expensive project. Brine disposal is a significant challenge, not just for us, but for any utility that relies on groundwater. We are working on several alternatives that could be cheaper and ideally, we’ll be able to present more economical numbers when we get to that point.
4. Are we going to discuss the improvement projects in detail? A: Yes, we will discuss the cost of each significant project, and the discussion will probably gravitate to discussing details.

2.1 Overview of Solid Waste Program (Adam Kurtz, Solid Waste Superintendent)

Solid Waste Superintendent Kurtz presented an overview of Goodyear’s solid waste program. During the question and answer period, the committee members had the following questions and responses provided are also below preceded by an “A”:

1. Why are we no longer replacing the smaller garbage/recycle containers? Some people can’t fill even the small ones and older folks don’t easily manage moving the large ones around. A: I think you mean the 35-gallon container. When we did the roll out, we provided several different sizes but found the smaller sized ones caused the others to be damaged. The arms on the trucks adjust and would adjust to the smaller size but then they’d crush the larger cans and it was difficult to maintain the stock on the others. The consistency wasn’t there. The 65-gallon size is really just a little bigger, there’s a misconception on size.
2. Are plastic container caps recyclable? They typically do not have the recycle symbol. A: Yes
3. Do we have any cooperative arrangements with other Cities in the valley to help handle, say a monsoon event? A: Yes, Mesa put together an IGA that was very descriptive on that. We have used Avondale’s equipment in the past and they’ve also helped us when needed.
4. In the event that a RAD truck/driver is in an accident, could the City of Goodyear be sued/held liable? A: No, the way the contract is written is that they would be responsible. It

- would fall to their insurance.
5. Why doesn't the City have specific mandates concerning the placing of trash cans and distribute to homeowners? A: We do. When we hand out a new container, there is a tri-fold brochure we provide and the inspectors also educate the residents.
 6. Is there an opportunity to better highlight what is recyclable? A: Always.
 7. Can you give some examples of plastics in each number category? A: It's on the website under Solid Waste.
 8. My understanding is that the market for recyclable material is not great. (China), what are we doing with the output of the MRF? A: It's a struggle, there's no way around it. RAD looks for opportunities and there are domestic markets they're using. MAG has been having discussions to figure out solutions. We anticipate more domestic markets as long as there is a need.
 9. Early on in COVID, recycling stopped on the back end, although it was still collected. Now that they're recycling again, it doesn't sound like the MRF has a buyer so does it just end up in landfills? Is that cost effective? A: In our contract with RAD, there are fees associated with recycling collection. There's no way around it and the issue with China put a huge damper on it so we're all playing catch up.
 10. It's evolving. Is there any thought Goodyear won't do it anymore...from you or from Council? If it's not selling, why do it? A: That's a good question and leads us into our next question.
 11. Why have some cities stopped recycling? A: For instance, with Surprise, when the whole thing happened with China, they were positioned to lose a lot of money so they imposed handling fees so the rate became too much to handle causing them to suspend their program. Deputy Public Works Director Smith added that every municipality has different contract terms with their recycling providers. The City of Phoenix had a significant deficit, so the rate payers filled the gap. Goodyear is in a great position, if there's no revenue, there are no charges but if there is revenue, we have revenue sharing in our contract. Regarding the temporary stop, a lot of it was related to COVID. With the MRF, the people working there are side by side and they couldn't provide distancing, but they've worked through that and are recycling again.
 12. Some neighborhoods have a lot of "green" waste, why not have green trash cans to minimize the contamination of recycle? A: We have considered it, but the additional service would require additional trucks and it is tough to manage, especially here where it becomes very dry. We did a pilot program and saw how expensive it was to maintain.
 13. Could the monthly In Focus magazine for Goodyear be used to inform citizens of dos and don'ts of recycling? I had no idea not to put bags into my can. A: Great! You've been educated. We've sent several information pieces over the years with magnets and such. It's part of our goals.
 14. Would it make sense to have a third glass only collection? A: We could look into it.
 15. Are we collecting data on how much certain neighborhoods contaminate recycling through the routes? A: Yes, when we do waste audits, we can pinpoint that.

- 16. Could the City use the In Focus magazine for citizens’ education on how well Goodyear does on recycling and how well we do dollar wise as compared to other cities? A: Great idea.
- 17. Is inspection done in gated communities? A: Yes, anywhere solid waste is serviced.
- 18. When do you anticipate the monthly drop off schedule for hazardous household waste? A: We are working on scheduling software so should have more information soon. With COVID, it’s been difficult so we’re working on it.
- 19. If paint is allowed to dry out in the container, can it be put in the regular pickup? A: Yes.
- 20. What is the duration of the contract with RAD? A: Seven years with an option to extend it.
- 21. Does the contract include a rate increase at any point? A: Rates are structured on the CPI index and fuel prices, but it would never be more than 4%.
- 22. Is participation in recycling voluntary or do you know what percentage of the 30,000 accounts participate or choose not to? A: Since we replaced one pickup with recycling, it is mandatory; however, residents have the option to add an additional trash container, but they have to pay for it.
- 23. Are the dimensions of the containers on the website? A: They used to be but I’m not sure. I can send it to you.
- 24. Can you explain how we collect recycling items as we do seem to mix garden trimmings with garbage? A: Yard waste is typically collected through curbside bulk trash pickup.

QUESTIONS FROM THE PUBLIC

None.

INFORMATION ITEMS

None.

NEXT MEETING

The next meeting is scheduled for August 18, 2020 at 5:00 p.m.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to discuss, Chairman McErlean adjourned the meeting at 6:46 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted by:

Chairman Name, Chairman

Date: _____